

*Chapter - 9*

**FINDINGS, SUGGESTIONS  
AND CONCLUSION**

<b>9.1</b>	<b>Major Findings</b>
<b>9.2</b>	<b>Tenability of Hypotheses</b>
<b>9.3</b>	<b>Best Practices Adopted/ Suggested by Respondents</b>
<b>9.4</b>	<b>Suggestions by the Respondents</b>
<b>9.5</b>	<b>Suggestions by the Researcher</b>
<b>9.6</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>
<b>9.7</b>	<b>Scope for Further Research</b>
	<b>References</b>

## CHAPTER - 9

### FINDINGS, SUGGESTIONS AND CONCLUSION

This chapter discusses major findings of this study, which have been drafted on the basis of the data analysis in Chapter 8. Tenability of the hypotheses is checked and suggestions are provided to improve the services in academic law libraries.

#### 9.1 MAJOR FINDINGS

##### 9.1.1 General Information

- B.A.-LL.B. is the most preferred course in law universities at bachelor level, only few universities are interested in B.Sc.-LL.B, B.B.A.-LL.B., B.Com.-LL.B. or B.S.W.-LL.B. Majority of the universities are offering LL.M. and Ph.D. but few are interested in interdisciplinary Master Level Programmes. (Table 8.2).
- Majority of the universities (60%) has separate library buildings and almost all the libraries have adequate seating capacity, except few which have not been accommodated in separate buildings. The average seating capacity is 40% of enrolled students. It is worth to mention that library of NLU Delhi is providing seating space for each and every enrolled student. (Table-8.3).
- The average opening hours of the libraries are 13 (hours) during the general days, 13:45 (hours) during examination and 7:30 (hours) for the Sundays and holidays. Some libraries (26%) remain open after 10:00 pm during the general days and 40% during the examination. There is no significant change in the number of libraries which change timings during the examination period. (Table 8.4).
- There is no fixed staffing pattern in law university libraries. The post of the University Librarian is vacant in all the universities except one and most of the libraries are headed by Assistant Librarian while few by Deputy Librarian. (Table-8.5). 60% of the respondents considered that the existing staff in their libraries is enough to run the library efficiently. (Table-8.5).

- Law degree is not a compulsory qualification for academic law librarians in India but still some of them have law degree. (Table 8.6).

### 9.1.2 Library Collection and Organisation

- All the libraries have sufficient collection of books for their registered students and in accordance with BCI Rules (Table-8.7). Besides books the libraries also maintain adequate collection of bound volumes of the law journals and reports (table-8.8). Other materials as CDs/ DVDs, theses/ dissertations, commission/ committee reports and research project reports are limited in numbers or unavailable in most of the libraries. (Table-8.9, 8.10, 8.11, 8.12).
- Majority of the libraries (66.66%) is subscribing less than 20 international journals/reports (print) and almost 60% libraries are subscribing more than 40 national journals/reports (print). (Table-8.13).
- Majority of the libraries subscribe 11-20 Magazines and 6-10 Newspapers in English and 2-5 Newspapers in regional language. (Table-8.14).
- Manupatra and HeinOnline are the most favorite online legal databases subscribed by all the libraries (100%). Subsequently, West Law India, SCC Online, LexisNexis, JStor are subscribed by majority of the libraries. CD/DVD based products of All India Reporter Pvt. Ltd. like AIR SC database, AIR HC database, AIR CrLJ, AIR Privy Council Database, which are recommended by the BCI for minimum library requirement, are not so popular in comparison of online legal databases. It is also evident that the databases like Menupatra, HeinOnline, SCC Online, LexisNexis, and West Law India etc. are providing a comprehensive solution for legal research in Indian. (Table-8.15).
- Majority of the libraries (60%) is member of the only consortia UGC Infonet Digital Library Consortium/Shodhsindhu under the special category for law universities. (Table-8.16).
- Majority of the libraries (93.33%) is providing IP based access to the subscribed databases and 53.33% are also providing remote access to the users out of campus. (Table-8.17).
- Majority of the libraries (86.66%) is following DDC and 13.33% are using UDC. (Table-8.18).

- Majority of libraries (80%) is adhering to MARC format (MARC 21). 13.33% libraries are using AACR-2 and only 6.66% are adhering to RDA. (Table-8.19).
- Majority of the libraries (80%) has OPAC to provide access to their holdings and 66.66% libraries also have Web-OPAC. (Table-8.20).

### **9.1.3 Activities for Collection Development**

- Majority of the librarians (80%) is following collection management policy and they are implementing it in their respective libraries. (Table-8.21 & 8.22).
- Publisher Catalogue is the most favorite book selection tool of the librarians followed by requisition slips, email announcements, approval plans, and book reviews. (Table-8.23).
- Average amount of expenditure on collection development for 3 years for few universities is extremely high while 33.33% libraries are utilizing up to 25 lakhs and 26.66% libraries have expenditure between 25-50 lakhs. (Table-8.24)
- There is no fixed pattern for books acquisition. The average number of acquired books for last three years ranges from 500 to 5800 in the respondent libraries. Few libraries are acquiring quite large number of books and some libraries are purchasing less number of books. (table-8.25). In case of periodical subscription the range of average number goes from 15 to 160. (Table 8.26).
- All the libraries have databases and the average number of databases subscribed for last three years varied from 3 to 16. (Table 8.27).

### **9.1.4 Library Services Provided by the Librarians**

- Majority of the librarians is providing most of the library services. Services like Abstracting and ILL are being provided by less than 50% librarians. (Table 8.28) There are different types of special provisions for Moot Court teams in various libraries.
- About 40% librarians are involved in publishing of information products/in-house database like publishing Indexing Periodicals covering

Indian as well as Foreign Journals, and developing bibliographic database for the journals subscribed by them. (Table-8.29)

- Most of the librarians (60%) are conducting users' survey to know the actual need of the users and their satisfaction with the library services. (Table-8.30).
- The information about library is being published by the 40% librarians. (Table-8.31).

#### **9.1.4 Application of ICT in Library**

- All the libraries have computers for library staff ranging from 3 to 22. The average of computers for library staff is 7. More than half of the libraries (53.33%) have 3 to 5 computers for library staff. NLU Delhi has provided the highest number of computers. (Table-8.32).
- All the libraries have computers to provide access to internet and e-resources ranging from 4 to 100 and the average of the number of computers for library users is 28. The number of computers in 8 libraries (53.33%) is below average; however most of the students have their own laptops in NLUs as mentioned by some respondents. (Table-8.33).
- In this study, it is found that majority of the librarians (86.66%) has completed library automation. It is very interesting to know that out of automated and partially automated libraries 50% libraries are using different commercial softwares and other 50% are using Open Source Software KOHA. Commercial software LibSys is the choice of 35.71% out of 14 automated libraries. (Table-8.34).
- It is found that out of those libraries which have been automated, the librarians have implemented RFID technology in 50% libraries and 42.87% are using Barcode system and remaining are using magnetic tape for managing their circulation services. It is evident that the task of implementing technology for circulation has been achieved by the librarians. (Table-8.35).
- Every law university has its own website which contains one or more pages with detailed information about the library facilities as responded by 100% librarians. Out of these 3 librarians (RGNLU, NLUJAA, NLUD) are managing a separate website/library blog/portal. (Table-8.36).

- In case of only 20% libraries, the staff is responsible for creation and updation of library webpages. (Table-8.37).
- Access to Internet and e-resources is available through Wifi in 93.33% universities out of them mostly universities are providing Wifi facility in whole campus and few have restricted this facility to library and hostels premises only. (Table-8.39).
- Majority of the librarians (86.66%) has not initiated cloud based library services. (Table-8.40).
- Only 8 librarians (53.33%) are using web 2.0 tools to deliver library services. Remaining are not using web 2.0 tools at all. (Table-8.41).

### **9.1.5 Activities to Support Open Access Movement**

- It is found that majority of the librarians is involved in various activities supporting to open access movement. (Table-8.42).
- The library staff of 26.66% universities has been involved in publication of journals or other materials in print format as well as online. (Table-8.43).
- Only 20% libraries have stopped any Journal/reporter due to its online free availability, which shows that the librarians have started to accommodate open access, though the number is small. (Table-8.44).
- Almost half of the libraries (46.66%) have created the institutional repository. Those who have created the institutional repository, they are also involved in creating awareness about the institutional repository using different mode. (Table-8.45 & 8.46).

### **9.1.6 Activities to Prevent Plagiarism in Research**

- It is found that 60% librarians have framed policy for plagiarism control. (Table-8.47). Most of the libraries (73.33%) have anti-plagiarism software out of which 7 libraries (63.63%) are using Turnitin, 3 libraries (27.27%) have Urkund and 1 library (9.10%) has Grammerly Check (Table-8.48). 8 libraries (72.72%) out of 11 have purchased software directly from vendor and 3 libraries (27.27%) are getting access through INFLIBNET (Table-8.49).

### **9.1.7 Activities to Support Legal Information Literacy**

- It is found that majority of the librarians (80%) is involved in Information Literacy (IL) instruction programmes in their respective institutions at introductory as well as advance level. (Table-8.50, 8.51).
- It is found that the most frequently covered topics in the IL programmes are introductory information of library resources, services and policies to their users; utility of library catalogue/OPAC or WEBOPAC; how to use legal databases; online search techniques, copyright and fair use (Table-8.52).
- Librarians who are involved in IL Programmed (N=12) are using different methods while conducting IL programmes. Face to face method is the favorite one, instructions at individual level on reference desk is also another way followed by most of the librarians. Online tutorial method, workshop/seminar method are also preferred by some librarians. (Table-8.53).
- In case of 8 universities out of 12, Legal Information Literacy is embedded in the curriculum. (Table-8.54). Papers in the curriculum wherein Legal Information Literacy is included are: Research Methods, Legal Methods, Legal Research Methods.

### **9.1.8 Perception and Opinion about Law Librarianship**

- On the basis of data in table-8.55, it is concluded that a degree in law with a degree in Library and Information Science is not essential for a law librarian.
- On the basis of significant data it is concluded that the role of librarianship in legal education and research is more important than their counterparts in other disciplines. (Table-8.56).
- It is evident from the data in table-8.57 that the view “Law Library Association is not essential for the professional development of law librarians in India” is not so significant.
- The data in table-8.58 strongly supports the view that “Bar Council of India should take initiative to form a consortium for academic law libraries”.

- Majority of the librarians is in favour of the view that National Law Universities should form LAWLIBNET like MANLIBNET. (Table-8.59).
- On the basis of data in table-8.60 it is concluded that law librarianship has not been recognized in India like Medical Librarianship or Management & Business Librarianship. It means law librarianship is in its nascent stage in India.
- The data in table-8.61 is significant enough to conclude that National Law Universities can play an important role for education and training in law librarianship. (Table-8.61).

## 9.2 TENABILITY OF HYPOTHESES

Tenability of the hypotheses has been checked in the light of above findings and available literature.

### Hypothesis 1

**Ho: National Law Universities have developed advanced libraries using ICT and principles of library and information science.**

**Ha: National Law Universities have not developed advanced libraries using ICT and principles of library and information science.**

National Law Universities (NLUs) are single faculty specialised state universities. NLUs are small in all aspects in comparison to the traditional state universities, but still majority of the universities (60%) have separate library building and almost all the libraries have adequate seating capacity. The post of University Librarian is vacant in most of the universities but 60% of the respondents considered that the existing staff is enough to run the library efficiently. Adequate print as well as online resources of law are available in majority of the libraries. Almost all the libraries are automated, the resources are classified and OPAC as well WebOPAC are available in majority of the libraries.

Majority of the librarians has framed collection management policy and they are implementing it in their respective libraries. (Table-8.21 & 8.22). 60% librarians have framed policy for plagiarism control (Table-8.47). Most of the libraries (73.33%) have anti-plagiarism software, majority of the librarians (80%) is involved in IL instruction programmes in their respective institutions. (Table-8.50).



Most of the libraries are less than 15 year old but using modern technology to provide library services. The presence of Wi-fi services, anti-plagiarism software, national and international legal database, remote access to e-resources, membership of consortia, implementation of open source software and RFID technology shows that the libraries are modern.

Therefore, alternative hypothesis is rejected.

## **Hypothesis 2**

***Ho:* The librarians are playing important role in the development of national law university libraries with the available infrastructure, resources and environment.**

***Ha:* The librarians are not playing important role in the development of national law university libraries with the available infrastructure, resources and environment.**

As it is evident from the various findings above, that most of the NLU libraries are very sound in terms of infrastructure, financial provision and other resources. Majority of the libraries is providing most of the library services, and special services to moot court teams. (Table 8.28). Majority of the libraries (80%) is involved in IL instruction programmes in their respective institutions. (Table-8.50). Open Access resources are available on the website of 80% libraries and 60% libraries have started to include bibliographic records of Open Access journals in library catalogues/databases. 60% librarians are organising user orientation programmes on Open Access Movement also. Librarians are using various methods to conduct information literacy programmes. The implementation of Web 2.0 tools and cloud computing have been initiated by the librarians. Purchasing of books and journals in print as well as electronic format, the processing of materials, responsibilities to publish information products, involvement in day to day administrative activities, etc., it becomes a huge task for the library staff. In most of the law libraries senior positions of librarians are vacant. Hence it can be extracted that law librarians are not under-utilised. They are playing their important role as much as possible.

Therefore, alternative hypothesis is rejected.

### **Hypothesis 3**

**Ho: Law librarianship is emerging as a specialised profession in India.**

**Ha: Law librarianship is not emerging as a specialised profession in India.**

The number of legal education centres and judicial institutions are increasing every year in India. Librarians are working in these institutions but officially there is no designation like “Law Librarian” in academic sector. In courts and judicial academies the qualifications of librarian include degree in law or experience in law libraries. The role of librarianship in legal education and research is more important than their counterparts in other disciplines (Table-8.56). The initiative has been taken by few institutes to start specialised course in law librarianship.

It is evident from the data in table-8.60 that law librarianship has not yet been recognised in India like Medical Librarianship or Management & Business Librarianship. There is no separate consortium of law libraries but INFLIBNET has provision of separate category for law university libraries. There is no network of law libraries and association of law libraries but attempts have been made (Vyas, 2010), (Narayan, 2011). On the basis of above discussion it is can be concluded that the specialised profession of law librarianship is in nascent stage in India and will grow in future.

Therefore, alternative hypothesis is rejected.

### **9.3 BEST PRACTICES ADOPTED/ SUGGESTED BY RESPONDENTS**

The librarians were asked to mention the best practices as adopted by them and to suggest for other libraries. Here is the summary of the best practices as prescribed by them.

- Facility of remote access to databases/ Remote Authentication service
- Library services through Social Networking.
- Digital Library using D-Space.
- Maximum Open Source Software in practice.
- Mostly in-house databases open in public domain
- To respond users instantly.
- To provide services according to user’s choice.
- Wi-fi access

- Implementation of RFID technology.
- Reference Service
- Current Awareness Service
- Personal Assistance in study and research of users.
- Indexing and Bibliography Service.
- Institutional repository.
- Online dissemination of information
- Online databases
- Use of anti-plagiarism software -Turnitin
- Orientation/training programme for students
- User awareness through new arrival display, use of notice board.

#### **9.4 SUGGESTIONS BY THE RESPONDENTS**

Best practices as suggested by the respondents for adoption in other academic law libraries:

- Enhance special Research assistance
- Provide better Reference services
- Enhance Open Access services
- Promote Inter-library Loan
- Establish Resource Sharing Network
- Participation in library development actively
- Need of friendly attitude of library staff
- Keep silence and peace in the library
- Attract the students to the library
- Conduct Library Orientation/Training programmes
- Provide access to online databases
- Provide remote access to databases
- Create Digital Library/ Institutional Repository using Open Source Softwares
- Use Social Networking websites to provide library services
- Promote Open Access Movement
- Inclusion of innovative library services
- Always try to reduce response time

The respondents were asked to give their comments, suggestions and opinions are as follows:

- There should be a subject specific consortium for law.
- There should be much awareness about the role and importance of librarianship in providing legal education and conducting legal research in National Law Universities.
- It would be highly appreciated if we could go for a law library network and consortium, so that, a number of good legal databases which will be available at low cost.
- Law librarianship in India is still in infancy stage.
- Due to increase in law institutions law librarianship will certainly have upper hand as compared to other branches of specialised librarianship.
- Librarian should be involved into the research and development process of the university and take lead in introducing open access, search strategies and copyright issues.
- Librarians should initiate the award of best reader to inculcate the reading habit among the users.
- Considering today's trend library should reach the user as and when needed.

## **9.5 SUGGESTIONS BY THE RESEARCHER**

The staff in different academic law libraries may vary depending upon various factors like collection, number of users, opening hours etc. As it is found that the post of University Librarian is vacant in all the libraries except one; it seems that, there may be some constraints to fill up this post, but it is suggested that every law university library should be headed by atleast Deputy Librarian, sufficient number of Assistant Librarians is also required to cope with the new challenges and responsibilities. BCI should clearly define the staffing pattern and the qualification of the library staff in law universities and law colleges as well.

“Law librarian is not only a guardian of law books but of law students too. He would appear helpless in the absence of technical expertise inspite of his personal willingness to help and navigate students.” (Patil, 2015). He “needs subject knowledge so that he can understand his readers, and in particular understand what

they are likely to want him to do or to produce for them, and in what manner they may like or need it done". (Finlay, 2001). It is suggested that a librarian should have a degree in Law or Law Librarianship to serve the legal fraternity.

Most of the libraries under this study have adequate seating space for their users. The libraries of CNLU, DSNLU, NLUO should increase the seating capacity in their respective libraries which is also required as per the BCI Rules.

Majority of the libraries subscribe common legal databases. Though, INFLIBNET has special category for only law universities under its programme UGC-INFONET Digital Library Consortium, still some important resources are not available through this consortium. There is a need to reconsider the list of law resources subscribed under this programme and extend this facility to law colleges and other universities also or BCI should come forward to form a Consortium for all types of academic law libraries.

Majority of the NLU libraries are providing IP based access to their subscribed online resources but BCI has emphasized on offline products in its Rules. There is a need to amend the BCI Rules and include the Clause for compulsory subscription of important online legal databases and their accessibility through Wifi and IP based access so that the students can access online legal resources through their smartphone, laptop, and other devices. There is also a need of improvement in IT infrastructure in some of the NLU libraries for student centric services.

Collection development is a very important activity in law libraries as the users require updated laws as amended time to time. Law literature published in foreign countries is costly and frequently required. To satisfy all types of requirements, law librarians should maintain a comprehensive written collection management policy and they should revise it periodically after due consultation with stakeholders.

The university authorities should encourage the library staff to participate in open access movement and to utilize the Web 2.0 tools to deliver library services. The library staff can play important role in online publishing/repository, if they have been given opportunity.

There is a need to understand that the role of librarianship in legal education and research is more important than other disciplines (as proved in this study), the teaching role of the academic law librarians should be acknowledged and it should not be limited to library orientation or information literacy programmes. Legal information literacy should be a part of the formal curriculum and librarian should be given the opportunity to teach the subjects in classrooms and National Law Universities should come forward for education and advance training of law librarians in this regard. Besides the specialised training programmes in law librarianship during the job, it is also necessary for Library and Information Science (LIS) Schools to start optional paper in law librarianship at Master's level.

The role of librarians for providing training in the use of technological tools/apps for education and research is interesting and challenging. The parent institution should provide support to librarians to make research more accessible.

## **9.6 CONCLUSION**

The present study is sought to have a look on the role of librarians with respect to the development of law libraries in National Law Universities and law librarianship in India. The law universities are considered as a centre of excellence for legal education. The number of law universities is substantially increased in last three decades, since the establishment of National Law School, Bangalore in 1986 under the leadership of Padamshri Prof. (Dr.) N. R. Madhava Menon. During the time most of them have been developed as a centre of excellence and others are still striving for excellence. But the movement of national law schools has made a lasting impact on legal education system and subsequently the emergence of law librarianship in India.

On the basis of this study it is concluded that all the surveyed libraries have adequate collection of books and bound volumes of law journals and reports for their respective users. In addition to print material important online legal information resources are also being subscribed. It is interesting to know that Manupatra and HeinOnline databases are being subscribed by each library. The study also affirms the finding of Clinch (2010b) that database services of Westlaw, Lexis and HeinOnline, which are most popular in UK, are also popular in academic law libraries in India as well. As for as library services are concern majority of the libraries is providing

general as well as specialised services to the users. There are different types of special provisions for the Moot Court Teams in various libraries.

The basic requirements of all the law universities are almost same but there is a lack of comprehensive guidelines or a model for the development of an excellent academic law library. Overall the librarians are involved in the development of libraries and supporting legal education in National Law universities with varying availability of resources. Collection development and its organisation in libraries, application of ICT for providing better library services, use of various methods to support legal education particularly information literacy, overall management of library including ICT infrastructure and e-resources are the focus areas of law librarians in NLU libraries.

“Law Librarians have an intrinsic role in the legal research process” (Hutchinson, 2014). This study also confirms that the role of librarianship in legal education and research is more important than their counterparts in other disciplines. The role of law librarians in NLUs is being played out but depending upon the situation and availability of infrastructure and resources. There is a need to recognize the importance of library and its resources formally in every law university.

There may be various factors affecting the status of law librarianship in India, from improper education and training in law librarianship to the opportunity to play their role for contribution to legal education, but it is the responsibility of both the existing law librarians and institutions of legal education to collaborate for the excellence of legal education and law librarianship as well. The step taken by Tamil Nadu Dr. Ambedkar Law University, Chennai to start Post Graduate Diploma in Law Librarianship is really laudable in this regard but National Law Universities should also take initiative for the education and training in law librarianship in India. The role of the law schools in the education of law librarians has been suggested in 1961 by Jacobstein also (Jacobstein, 1962). The existing experienced law librarians can play their role in advanced training of law librarians and curriculum design. Professor Cihak (2005) advises to law librarians that their future will be bright if they will “heed the need to change, learn to adapt, and use every means at their disposal to be wise stewards of their resources.”

Of course the role of law librarians is quite different and significant from other librarians. In present scenario to acquire all the competencies required for a good academic law librarian is a challenge and at the same time it seems that less number of qualified staff in academic law libraries is also a big hurdle for implementation of legal information literacy among the law students in India.

The role of librarian will continue to be changed with the advancement of ICT and its application for teaching and learning but the sole purpose of the librarianship “is surely to make information available to those who need it, when it is needed, in the form in which it is needed.” (Foskett, 1997). To follow the basic philosophy of librarianship, a law librarian needs specialised knowledge and skills to provide services to the legal fraternity in a better way.

## **9.7 SCOPE FOR FURTHER RESEARCH**

This study brings into light on several topics on which further research can be directed. Based on the findings of the present study the following suggestions have been made for further research:

- Comparative study of National Law University libraries and Law College libraries, as both are governed under the same rules of BCI.
- Comparison of NLU libraries with IIT or IIM libraries will also generate new knowledge.
- A study to create a model library for National Law University can also be important for newly established/proposed National Law Universities.
- Feasibility study to form a consortium of National Law University Libraries, as most of the libraries are subscribing the same e-resources.
- Impact of Free Access to Law Movement on Law Libraries.
- Studies can be conducted to design and develop model curriculum for Master level courses in Law Librarianship in Indian universities and for professional training programmes in Human Resources Development Centres.
- Challenges and issues of law librarianship, competencies of law librarians and various aspects of legal information literacy can be studied in Indian context.



## REFERENCES

- Cihak, H. E. (2005). Law Libraries: Maximising their Impact and Resources. *Law Library Journal* , 97 (2), 405-410.
- Clinch, P. (2010b). SLS/BIALL Academic Law Library Survey 2008/2009. *Legal Information Management* , 10 (4), 291-305.
- Finlay, R. (2001). Education for Law Librarianship: Past and Present. *Australian Law Librarian* , 9 (3), 200-212.
- Foskett, A. C. (1997). *The Subject Approach to Information* (5th Ed. Rep. ed.). London: Library Association Publishing.
- Hutchinson, T. (2014). Vale Bunny Watson? Law Librarians, Law Libraries, and Legal Research in the Post-Internet Era. *Law Library Journal* , 106 (4), 579-592.
- Jacobstein, J. M. (1962). The Role of the Law Schools in the Education of Law Librarians. *Law Library Journal* , 55, 209-212.
- Narayan, U. (2011). Law Librarianship in India. In R. A. Danner, & J. Winterton (Eds.), *The IALL International Handbook of Legal Information Management* (1st ed., pp. 137-142). Farnham: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.
- Patil, P. (2015). Legal Education in India: Threshold Limitations and Tentative Solutions. *University News* , 53 (18), 12-22.
- Vyas, S. D. (2010). Role of Academic Law Libraries with Special Reference to NALSAR University of Law Library, Hyderabad. *Library Herald* , 48 (1), 12-24.